Heinrich Schütz’ Passions and Historiae in Editions of the Late-19th and Early-20th Centuries

by

RAY ROBINSON

In the years between 1834, when Carl von Winterfeld’s landmark study on Gabrieli\(^1\) appeared in print, and 1927, the date when the last of the works in this genre was first available in a performing version, thirteen editions of the Passions and Historiae of Heinrich Schütz (in addition to the Gesamtausgabe) were published in Germany, England and France. Each was responsible for creating a certain perception of the composer in a period when he was virtually unknown to the musical public. We accept von Winterfeld’s work as an important contribution in re-establishing the composer as an historical personality, the point at which Schütz emerged as a life figure from the musical past who had something significant to say to the musical present.

The Complete Works edition of Philipp Spitta (1841-1894) contributed enormously to this developing picture of a seventeenth century composer who, while certainly known to performers and scholars in the mid-nineteenth century was nevertheless »seen through a glass darkly« (»durch einen Spiegel ein dunkles Bild«), to paraphrase the words of St. Paul. There is no question but that Spitta set the standard against which work on the Dresden master is still measured. Others have come along to edit these works and to make them more accessible to the performers of the time. It is about these editions that this essay is written. The purpose of this paper is thus to explore the reception of Schütz in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries through the identification and investigation of the earliest published performing editions of his Passions and Historiae.

I. Early efforts

On December 28, 1842, an article entitled »Biographische Notizen älterer Tonmeister nebst Proben aus ihren Werken« appeared in the Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung.\(^2\) Written by the Leipzig organist and bibliographer Carl Ferdinand Becker (1804-1877), this short essay on Heinrich Schütz was as significant in its own way as Winterfeld’s Gabrieli study in that it brought to the attention of musical scholars and performers for the first time the music of the composer as it is revealed in the Passions. While the information included in the article is primarily biographical, its importance to present day musical scholars lies in the fact that in the supplement of the periodical, under the heading »Drei Charfreitagsgesänge,«

---

1 Carl von Winterfeld, Johannes Gabrieli und sein Zeitalter (Berlin, 1834; reprint ed. Hildesheim, 1965).
the author includes the closing choruses to three Schütz Passions: St. Matthew, St. John, and, what Becker thought at the time was, the composer’s St. Mark Passion.\(^3\) In the body of the article, Becker places these works in historical perspective:

The Songs which follow are the last which Schütz wrote. We borrow them from a work [sic], which until now remains unknown to musical historical research, from the: History of the Suffering and Death of our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ from the Evangelists St. Matthew, St. Mark, St. Luke and St. John in the musical setting of Heinrich Schütz. [...] With this great work the Master completed his artistic life journey, and soon his life.\(^4\)

The manner in which these choruses are presented in the periodical reveal that Becker, although considering the collection as one rather than four works, is nevertheless sensitive to the fact that Schütz is not only an important historical figure but a composer with a particular musical style as well. There is no attempt to add anything to the work of the composer, whether dynamic, expression or tempo markings. Becker merely presents these works in a manner which is consistent with the way he discovered them (in the manuscript copy which was made long after the composer’s death by Johann Zacharias Grundig, 1669-1720).\(^5\) This view of Schütz in the mid-nineteenth century is a significant one in that it demonstrates that the initial perception of the composer, by a Leipzig musician who had experienced the Bach revival first hand, was one of great respect and awareness of the distinctive musical style of the 17th century.

It is twenty-eight years before a Passion, or in this case excerpts from the Schütz Passions, again appears in print. On this occasion it is in a performing, rather than a scholarly, edition. Carl Friedrich Riedel (1827-1888), a well-known Leipzig chorus master and composer, prepared a version of the Passions in 1870 which consisted of selected choruses and recitatives from what he also thought were the four Passions. As a student of Becker and the theorist and Thomas Cantor, Moritz Hauptmann (1792-1868), both of whom had been appointed to the staff of the Leipzig Conservatory by Felix Mendelssohn, Riedel was well-schooled in the historical tradition of music. Two years after completing his studies at the Conservatory he founded a choral society (1854), which in the following year became known as the Riedel’scher Verein. This chorus grew from a modest quartet of male voices to one of the most distinguished choral organizations in Germany, performing music of all periods, but giving special emphasis to Protestant choral works by Johann Sebastian

\(^3\) Recent research by Wolfram Steude has identified Marco Gioseppe Peranda (c. 1625-1675) as the composer of what was originally thought to be the St. Mark Passion of Schütz. Cf. WOLFRAM STEUDE, editor. HEINRICH SCHÜTZ, MARCO GIOSEPPE PERANDA, Passionsmusiken nach den Evangelisten Matthäus, Lukas, Johannes und Markus, Faks. nach den Partiturhandschriften der Musikbibliothek der Stadt Leipzig, mit einem Kommentar von WOLFRAM STEUDE (Leipzig: Zentralantiquariat der Deutschen Demokratischen Republik, 1981).

\(^4\) BECKER, p. 1045. »Nachfolgende Gesänge sind die letzten, welche Schütz schrieb. Wir entleuchten sie aus einem Werke, das bis jetzt den sämtlichen musikalischen Geschichtsforshern unbekannt blieb, aus der: Historia des Leidens und Sterbens unsers Herrn und Heylandes Jesu Christi nach dem Evangelisten St. Matthaeum, St. Marcum, St. Lucam und St. Johannem in die Musik übersetzt von Heinrich Schütz. [...] Mit diesem großen Werke beschloss der Meister seine Kunstauf- bahn, wie bald darauf sein Leben.«

\(^5\) The Grundig copy is located in the Musikbücherei der Stadt Leipzig.
Bach, Johannes Eccard, Johann Wolfgang Franck, and, of course, Schütz. Because of its prominence as a choral ensemble, these performances brought renewed attention to these »forgotten« composers.

Riedel's Passion edition was published in 1870 by the Leipzig firm E. W. Fritzsche and dedicated to »Seiner Majestät Johann König von Sachsen«; it was also distributed simultaneously in Strasbourg, Zurich, Basel, St. Gallen, St. Petersburg, London and New York. It was thus the first printing of any part of a Schütz Passion to receive distribution outside of Germany, including the English-speaking countries.

The »Passion« is constructed in four sections: Part One (Introduction) — the beginning of the Passion story as it is presented in St. Mark's Gospel; Part Two (The taking of Christ prisoner) — textual excerpts from St. John, St. Luke and St. Mark; Part Three (The trial) — narrative excerpts from all four Gospels; Part Four (The crucifixion) — story excerpts from St. John, St. Mark and St. Matthew (in that order). The large divisions of the work are then broken down into twenty-three subsections consisting of individual choral and recitative parts: 11 from the St. Mark Passion (of Peranda); 6 from St. John, 5 from St. Matthew, and 1 from St. Luke. With eleven of the segments taken from the spurious St. Mark Passion, and the remaining 12 chosen it would seem at random from the three other Schütz Passions, the residue is aptly described in 1906 by the theologian Friedrich Spitta (1851-1924) as a musical work in which »no trace of the style of Schütz is left.« Nevertheless this rather free adaptation of the Passion story, with its extensive Foreword describing the performances of it by the Riedel'scher Verein (five complete performances are identified in the »Foreword«), was well known at the time, and these public readings helped to stimulate interest in Schütz and his work. Therefore, its importance to the Schütz revival in the nineteenth century should not be underestimated.

It is clear from studying this edition that Riedel viewed Schütz not so much as an obscure historical figure but as a composer whose Passions were especially well suited for choral performances. While he adds dynamic, expression and tempo markings to guide the performer, he also adheres strictly to the essence of the Grundig copy which he had studied in the Leipzig Stadtbibliothek and indicates in the »Foreword« that he prefers a method of performance in which the choruses are sung without accompaniment. What he accomplishes in this early arrangement of the composer's three Passions is to give the broader musical public a picture of Schütz the choral composer whose works are indeed accessible to choirs and choral societies. He confirms this perception by his own performances of the »Passion« with the Riedel'scher Verein.

Fifteen years after the appearance of the German edition, and ironically in the same year the Spitta edition of the Gesamtausgabe was published (1885), an Eng-
lish version of the »Riedel Passion« appears in London and New York under the title: History of the Suffering and Death of Our Lord and Savior Jesus Christ: Choruses and Recitatives from the Four Passions by Heinrich Schütz. While no editor is listed on the title page, and no credit whatsoever is given to Riedel, the only clue to editorial direction is provided by a single sentence at the bottom of the first page of music which reads:

The adaptation of the English words of the Choruses of the Christian community is by Dr. H. W. Dulcken.  

Since no reference to Dr. Dulcken is to be found in any standard biographical reference, it is not clear whether he also served as musical editor as well.

This curious publication, which gave musicians in Great Britain and the United States their first view of a Schütz Passion with an English text, follows the general outline of the Riedel edition but is much shorter. In contrast to the 1870 version with its 23 sections and four large divisions, the English edition contains only 11 sections (see Chart I, pp. 116-117), of which one (No. 5) is shortened and another (No. 6) is moved to the end of No. 5 and combined with it. Part One is the most complete with inclusions from each section of the original; Part Two contains only 2 recitative and 2 choral sections; while Parts Three and Four consist only of the closing choruses from the St. Luke, St. John and St. Matthew Passions in one large movement called »Choruses from the Christian Community.«

The musical characteristics of this publication by Novello, Ewer and Co. in England and G. Schirmer in the United States are even less in keeping with the integrity of the composer’s style than the original version: The work is accompanied throughout, contains extensive editorial additions, replaces the St. Mark text in the recitative sections of Part One with an English translation of the account in St. Matthew’s Gospel, and, with so much cut from the original arrangement, is little more than a choral work based on the music from Paranda’s St. Mark Passion with the closing choruses of the other three Passions completing the piece. Today we can only speculate how the work was received when it appeared in 1885 as the first work of the composer with an English text to find its way into the repertory. It is little wonder that Schütz was »seen through a glass darkly« in the early period of his revival.

Three years after the publication of the original version of the »Riedel Passion« the firm of E. W. Fritzsch announced the release of another Schütz edition by Riedel, Die sieben Worte am Kreuz (SWV 478).  

Published simultaneously in the same countries, it is the first complete work of the composer in this genre to receive foreign distribution. Like the »Passion«, this is also a performing edition and includes specific instructions for the conductor regarding the opening and closing choruses:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Type of movement (Text in German Version)</th>
<th>German</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Ja nicht auf das Fest (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Was soll doch dieser Unrath (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Wo willst du (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X&lt;sup&gt;14&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Bin ich's, bin ich's? (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus, Judas (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X&lt;sup&gt;15&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Wer Gottes Marter in Ehren hat (St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART TWO</th>
<th>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. John)</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Jesum von Nazareth (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7b.</td>
<td>Chor. Jesum von Nazareth (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Herr, Herr sollen wir (St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Jesus (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Schlußchor. Dank sei unsrem Herrn (St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PART THREE</th>
<th>Chor. Wer Gottes Marter in Ehren hat (St. Luke)</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>X&lt;sup&gt;16&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Falsche Zeugen (St. Matthew)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Er ist des Todes schuldig (St. Matthew)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. Matthew)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Weissage uns, wer dich schlug? (St. Matthew)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Pilatus, Jesus (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Nicht diesen, sondern Barrabam (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Sei gegrüßet, lieber Judenkönig (St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>14</sup> Shortened in the English version.  
<sup>15</sup> Moved to the beginning of Part III.  
<sup>16</sup> Moved from the closing chorus of Part I.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Type of movement (Text in German Version)</th>
<th>German</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Pilatus</td>
<td>(St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Kreuzige, kreuzige ihn!</td>
<td>(St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist, Pilatus</td>
<td>(St. Mark)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chor. Kreuzige, kreuzige ihn!</td>
<td>(St. Luke)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recitative. Evangelist</td>
<td>(St. John)</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>Schlußchor. O hilf, Christe Gottes Sohn</td>
<td>(St. John)</td>
<td>X X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PART FOUR**

| 18.     | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. John) | X         |
|         | Chor. Schreibe nicht der Judenkonig    | (St. John) | X         |
|         | Recitative. Evangelist, Pilatus         | (St. John) | X         |
| 19.     | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. Mark) | X         |
|         | Chor. Pfui dich                         | (St. Mark) | X         |
| 20.     | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. Matthew) | X         |
|         | Chor. Andern hat er geholfen            | (St. Matthew) | X         |
| 21.     | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. Mark) | X         |
|         | Chor. Siehe, er rufet den Elias        | (St. Mark) | X         |
| 22.     | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. Matthew) | X         |
|         | Chor. Halt, läßt sehen, ob Elias       | (St. Matthew) | X         |
|         | Recitative. Evangelist                 | (St. Matthew) | X         |
| 23.     | Schlußchor. Ehre sei dir, Christi      | (St. Matthew) | X X         |

This Chorus [the opening chorus], likewise the Closing Chorus No. V, can be sung completely without accompaniment, if the ability to sing a cappella is secure. Where this is not the case, and when it becomes advisable, the Continuo with Violoncellos and Contrabasses may be used with strict observation of the precise dynamic markings. The additional organ part can, after the way is established, play alone, or in connection with the Continuo, support the singers, or become useful in dynamic support.17

It is significant to note in the »Foreword« that Riedel discusses the use of instruments in the performance of this work; a clear indication that he is sensitive to the need to follow the intentions of the composer as they are expressed in the seventeenth century copy of the score which he had studied.18 This is the first time that performance practice as such is discussed in any of the published editions of

---

17 **RIEDEL, Die sieben Worte, p. 1:** »Dieser Chor, ebenso der Schlußchor No. V, kann ganz ohne Begleitung gesungen werden, falls die Ausübenden im A capella-Gesang Festigkeit besitzen. — Wo dies nicht der Fall ist, wird es ratsam sein, den Continuo von Violoncello's u. Contrabassen unter Beachtung genauer dynamischer Anschmieglichkeit an die Unterstimme mit spielen zu lassen. — Die hinzugefügte Orgelstimme kann nach Befinden weggelassen, oder aber allein, oder in Verbindung mit dem Continuo zur Unterstützung des Gesangschores, oder zu dessen dynamischer Verstärkung gebraucht werden.«

18 The copy of Die sieben Worte, discovered by Otto Kade in 1855, is housed in the Landesbibliothek, Kassel.
the Passions or Historia. As in the case of the »Passion,« this edition is influential in creating interest in the music of Schütz among performers and scholars of the time. An English version of the work appeared in 1890 with a translation by Walter Damrosch.19

II. Performing editions for the church

The decade of the 1880s proved to be of great significance in the movement to make the music of Schütz more accessible to scholars and performers. The Schütz-Gesamtausgabe (SGA) was published on the three hundredth anniversary of the composer’s birth and the first of three Passion editions by Arnold Mendelssohn (1855-1933) appeared two years later. As in the case of the Riedel editions the publications of Mendelssohn contributed positively to the Schütz revival of the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century, especially in the acceptance of these works by the church. In his lifetime, Mendelssohn prepared editions of twelve Schütz works20, spanning the years 1887 to 1926, of which four—the three Passions and the Christmas History—are of special interest in this discussion.

Mendelssohn’s earliest efforts in this area—the publications of the St. Matthew (1887) and St. John (1890) Passions—first appear in a collection of sacred works whose general editor is the Königsberg theologian Friedrich Zimmer (1855-1919). These editions are designed to encourage the performance of these works within the context of the worship liturgy. To facilitate this purpose, Zimmer develops an extensive liturgical formula which incorporates sections of the Passion into the services of Lent and/or Holy Week, which ever proves to be the most appropriate for the local congregation. For example, his Agenda for the St. Matthew Passion (SWV 479) is spread over seven services. It is designed so that parts of the work can be sung beginning with either the first Sunday of Lent and continuing until Palm Sunday, or Palm Sunday and ending on the Saturday before Easter. Each of the services follows a similar pattern with the choir beginning the service with the chorale »O Lamm Gottes unschuldig« and closing with the final chorus of the St. Matthew Passion (»Ehre sei dir, Christe«). The rest of the service consists of congregational singing, sentences, scriptural readings, prayers and a portion of the Passion that includes the narrative of the Evangelist and the commentary of the choir. At the back of the published vocal score Mendelssohn adds an appendix which lists twelve chorales with suggested musical settings from the seventeenth century. Mendelssohn is quick to point out that only chorales from the time of

20 The Schütz works ed. by Arnold Mendelssohn: Drei kleine geistliche Konzerte (»Was hast du verwirket,« SWV 307; »Vom Namen Jesu,« SWV 308; »O du allerbarmherzigster Jesu,« SWV 309); from the Musikalische Exequer, SWV 281 (»Herr, nun lässest du deinen Diener«); »Gott sei Dank« (An Easter Hymn); form the Symphonia sacrae III (»O Jesu süß«, SWV 406); the three Passion Histories (St. Matthew, SWV 479; St. Luke, SWV 480; St. John, SWV 481); Weihnachtshistoria, SWV 435; »Unser Herr Jesus Christus,« SWV 423; and »Verleih uns Frieden,« SWV 372.
Schütz are appropriate for these services. The suggested order of worship for the Saturday before Easter [or the seventh service if the liturgy is spread over the six weeks of Lent] is illustrated in Chart II (pp. 120-121).

As a composer himself Mendelssohn felt free to take substantial liberties with these works, but his primary goal was to arrange them so that they would be effective in the Lutheran worship service. Therefore these editions all contain a special Mendelssohnian touch. For example, the choruses are all supported with keyboard (organ or piano) accompaniment. However, Mendelssohn states in the »Foreword« that he considers the addition of the organ part in these editions merely a concession to practical necessity, stressing that performances without accompaniment would represent the ideal, even in the recitatives22 where he fixes the rhythm and brings the composer’s quasi-neumatic notation into modern usage.

His original accompaniments to the various narrative figures in the story (i.e. Evangelist, Jesus, Judas) employ elements of both recitativo secco and recitativo accompagnato. The organ part that »supports« the duet of the »Two false witnesses« (»Zwei falsche Zeugen«) contains stylistic elements typical of the High Baroque, although Mendelssohn states that the models for these additions to the original texture of the Schütz Passions are the composer’s Weihnachtshistoria and Auferstehungshistoria, not the works of Bach.23 When we study the editions of the Schütz Passions that follow in the twentieth century, it is clear that Mendelssohn’s two most influential innovations are the chorale insertions and the accompanied recitatives.

Mendelssohn’s edition of the St. John Passion (SWV 481), which was published three years later, followed the same editorial practices:

For the performance of the St. John Passion to be valid, the same remarks I have made in the St. Matthew Passion should be generally followed. Allow me to refer to the Foreword of the last work [St. Matthew] and point out only the necessary suggestions to be made.24

These recommendations included the insertion of seven chorales at appropriate points in the Passion story, including one after the closing chorus. As a point of interest, only two of the chorales from the St. Matthew list are suggested for St. John: »Jesu, deine Passion« and »O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden.«25 All the other editorial practices found in St. Matthew are present here as well.

---

22 Mendelssohn, Matthäus, p. 15.
23 Mendelssohn, Matthäus, p. 15.
24 Heinrich Schütz, Historia des Leidens und Sterbens unsres Herrn und Heilandes Jesu Christi nach dem Evangelisten St. Johannes, ed. by Arnold Mendelssohn (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1890), »Vorwort,« p. [iii]. »Für die Aufführung der vorliegenden Bearbeitung der Schütz’schen Passion nach Johannes gelten im Allgemeinen dieselben Bemerkungen, die ich der Matthäuspassion desselben Componisten vorausgeschickt habe. Ich erlaube mir daher, auf die Vorrede zu letztgenanntem Werke zu verweisen und möchte an dieser Stelle nur für die nothwendigen Choraleinlagen Vorschläge machen.«
CHART II: THE LITURGY FOR THE SATURDAY BEFORE EASTER
(MENDELSSOHN/ZIMMER, 1887)

Choral introit: O Lamm Gottes unschuldig (p. 86 [Breitkopf & Härtel edition])

Organ prelude: [To be selected by the organist]

Congregation: (To the melody, »Wer nun den lieben Gott läßt walten«)

Es ist vollbracht! Es ist verschieden,
Mein Jesus schließt die Augen zu;
Der Friedefürst entschläf in Frieden,
Die Lebenssonne geht zur Ruh
Und sinkt in stille Todesnacht.
O großes Wort: Es ist vollbracht!

Es ist vollbracht! Ihr, meine Sünden,
Verdammet nun mein Herz nicht mehr,
Von Himmel her hör' ich verkünden:
Des Sohnes Blut erlangt Gehör,
Am Kreuz hat's Frieden uns gemacht.
O süßes Wort: Es is vollbracht!

Es is vollbracht! Ich will mich legen
Zur Ruh auf Christi Grabesstein.
Die Engel sind allhier zugegen,
Ich schlummre sanft mit Jakob ein,
Die Himmelspfort' ist aufgemacht.
O Lebenswort: Es ist vollbracht!

Confession of sin and Scripture reading (As above)

Chorale [Choir]: O Traurigkeit, etc. (p. 87)

Evangelist and Choir: »Und sehe da, der Vorhang im Tempel zerriß ...« (p. 66) [from the St. Matthew narrative]

Congregation: (To the melody, »Gott des Himmels und der Erden)

Einer ist es, dem ich lebe,
Den ich liebe früh und spät;
Jesus ist es, dem ich gebe,
Was er mir gegeben hat.
Ich bin in dein Blut verhüllt,
Führe mich, Herr, wie du willt.

Prayer

Organ piece [To be selected by the organist]

Evangelist and Choir: »Und am Abend kam ein reicher Mann von Arimathia ...« (p. 69) [from the St. Matthew narrative]
Chorale [Choir]: (To the melody »O Traurigkeit! O Herzeleid!« (p. 87)
So ruhest du,
O meine Ruh,
In deiner Grabeshöhle
Und erweckst durch deinen Tod
Meine todte Seele.
O Lebensfürst,
Ich weiß, du wirst
Mich wieder auferwecken:
Sollte denn mein gläubig Herz
Vor der Gruft erschrecken?
Sie wird mir sein
Ein Kämmerlein,
Da ich auf Rosen liege,
Weil ich nun durch deinen Tod
Tod und Grab besiege.

Evangelist and Choir: »Und des anderen Tages, der da folgete nach dem Rüsttage ...« (p. 71) [from the St. Matthew narrative]

Congregation: (Melody to »Nun lasset uns den Leib begraben)
Der du, Herr Jesu, Ruh und Rast
In deinem Grab gehalten hast,
Gib, daß wir in dir ruhen all,
Und unser Leben dir gefall'.
Wir danken dir, o Gottes Lamm,
Getötet an des Kreuzes Stamm;
Laß ja uns Sündern deine Pein
Den Eingang in das Leben sein.

Closing [Choir]

»Ehre sei dir Christe, der du littest Noth« [closing chorus from the St. Matthew Passion] (p. 75)

A period of thirty-six years passed between the publication of Mendelssohn's St. John Passion (1890) and the completion of his edition of the least known and performed of the Schütz Passions, the St. Luke Passion (SWV 480). In the »Foreword« of this, his last effort in this genre, he writes:

The great distribution which the Schütz Passions after Matthew and John have found in my arrangements has persuaded me to work on the Master's St. Luke Passion as well. It is essentially the same principles that will be applied [...] and then he goes on to repeat that significant statement which he makes in the critical comments of the two other editions:

[...] although the performance a cappella is ideal, an organ part can be added [to this work as well].

Mendelssohn was undoubtedly aware of the substantial discoveries in musicology that were occurring in the 1920s. These could have influenced his approach to this edition, but the foregoing statement and the fact that the choral parts in St. Luke are unaccompanied are the only concessions to the emerging «early music» movement that are apparent in this publication.

In the first page of this new edition, we are struck by two immediate changes from the Spitta GSA version: He has raised the key of the work a major second, and he has composed an original organ prelude for performances that take place as a part of a worship service. He also suggests the inclusion of chorales for these occasions, but in this publication the number is reduced to two: one between the organ prelude and the opening chorus («Herr stärke mich, dein Leiden zu bedenken») and the other («O geheimnisreiche Liebe») after the closing chorus. It is curious that these insertions, including the organ prelude, are not listed in the Table of Contents; this is perhaps an indication of the editor’s intention to make a clearer distinction between church and concert performances than was apparent in the other two Passion editions.

Another small but significant change from the Spitta edition that may go unnoticed in this publication is the absence of the designation «The Jews» («Die Juden») from the choruses in St. Luke that usually carry the title in the Passion. One could speculate that this deliberate omission might have been precipitated by the political and social conditions that were present in Germany at that time (1926).

The Weihnachts-Oratorium, Mendelssohn’s other contribution to the published editions of Schütz in the category Passions and Historiae, was completed seven years before Arnold Schering’s important discovery in 1908 of the manuscript of the instrumental and vocal parts of this work in the collection of Gustav Düben (1624-1690) in the University Library of Uppsala, Sweden. Since the history of this composition has been discussed previously in the Schering, Schöneich, and Mendelssohn editions, and more recently in an admirable essay by Eva Linfield, we will not attempt to deal with it here. It must only be said that just as Philipp Spitta was forced to prepare the Gesamtausgabe version without having had access to the complete manuscript, Mendelssohn was faced with a similar task: To produce a performing edition from source materials that included only the Evangelist’s recitatives and their accompanying figured bass parts. Spitta’s choice was to publish only those portions which appeared in Schütz’ own publication of 1664. Therefore, if Mendelssohn was to publish a work that was «complete», given the few fragments

---

27 Mendelssohn, Lucas, «Vorwort.»
28 Mendelssohn, Lucas, «Vorwort.» p. 27.
30 For further information about the «checkered» history of this work, the reader is referred to the critical notes in the editions of Spitta, Schering, Schöneich, and Mendelssohn.
of the work which he had at his disposal, he would need to compose original material for the opening chorus, the eight Intermezzi (Intermedia), and the closing chorus. By his own admission, Mendelssohn's version represents a significant departure from the original:

This edition is essentially another work, based on the Passions of the Master. With these works [the Passions] it was only necessary to provide the rhythm for the recitatives and the organ accompaniment. For the Christmas History, on the other hand, it was necessary to compose new compositions for the collection of choral pieces, also for the part of the Angel and Herod.32

As he does in his Passion editions, Mendelssohn suggests the insertion of chorales when the Christmas History is performed in church. He also places the same constraints on the use of these chorales that he does in his Passion editions:

Should these chorales be sung, it is better to select pieces from the 16th century, therefore from Hassler, Vulpius, Praetorius, Eckard, etc.; not such from Bach.33

In this case, his suggestions for accretions to the original work include three chorales for congregation, five for choir, and an organ »Pastorale« by J.S. Bach (BWV 590). Finally, he recommends the use of a children's choir in liturgical performances. The total result is a new work indeed, with only the Master's recitative movements surviving from the original.

Schering's edition of the Weinachts-Oratorium34, the first published version based on the composer's complete work, obviously differs from Mendelssohn's setting in a number of ways. For example, because he had access to the Düben manuscript, the opening chorus follows the composer's directions and begins the choral section at measure 9, whereas Mendelssohn brings in the chorus immediately. This later edition (1909) also adds a seven measure »Amen« section at the end of the opening chorus, a feature that is absent from both the Spitta and Mendelssohn versions.

Since Schering is the first editor to prepare both a Complete Works and a performing edition of any of the »Historia,« he is faced with some interesting decisions regarding this problematic work. His solution to the issue of reconciling the differences between the part of the Evangelist in the Schütz (1664) and the Düben (c. 1661) versions is to publish both in his Complete Works edition, and include a newly realized figured bass part by Otto Taubmann in the performing edition.35 In the area of instrumentation, he chooses to leave the composer's original specifications in the Gesamtausgabe, but in an apparent attempt to translate the intentions

32 MENDELSOHN, Weihnachts-Oratorium, »Vorwort,« p. [i]. »Die Aufgabe des Bearbeiters ist bei diesem Werke daher eine wesentlich andere gewesen, als bei den Passionen des Meisters. Bei diesen war die Musik vollständig vorhanden; es mußten nur die Recitative rhythmisiert und mit Orgelbegleitung versehen werden. Bei der Weihnachtshistorie dagegen mußten sämtliche Chorsätze, sowie die Partien der Engel und des Herodes neu componirt werden.«


34 SGA 17, ed. by Arnold Schering (1909).

35 HEINRICH SCHÜTZ, Weihnachts-Oratorium, ed. by Arnold Schering with the figured bass realization by OTTO TAUBMANN (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1909).
of the composer to performance practices in the early twentieth century, he makes the decision to include modern instruments in his performing edition. The result is a published version that takes some steps toward authenticity, but falls far short of realizing the original intentions of the composer. Consequently, when one studies the three earliest editions of the Christmas History (Spitta, Mendelssohn, and Schering) there is a significant difference in the performing forces. Chart III compares the instrumental resources in these three versions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Spitta (1885)</th>
<th>Mendelssohn (1901)</th>
<th>Schering (1909)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Opening</td>
<td>9 parts in 2 Choirs; 4 vocal &amp; 5 inst., Bc.</td>
<td>4 vocal, Organ</td>
<td>4 vocal, 2 Vln., Vla., 2 Trmb., Bassoons, Bass, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermedium I</td>
<td>2 Violettten, 1 Violon, Bc.</td>
<td>2 Vln., Organ</td>
<td>2 Vla., Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo II</td>
<td>2 Violinen, 1 Violon, Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>2 Vln, Bassoons, Bass, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo III</td>
<td>Flöten, Fagotte Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>2 Fl., Bassoon, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo IV</td>
<td>2 Violini, Fagotte, Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>2 Vln., Bassoons, Bass, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo V</td>
<td>2 Trombonen, Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>2 Trmb., Bass, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo VI</td>
<td>2 Clarinen oder Cornetten</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>2 Clarini, Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo VII</td>
<td>2 Violen, Bc.</td>
<td>2 Vln., Organ</td>
<td>2 Vla., Organ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evangelist</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
<td>Organ</td>
<td>Bc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermezzo VIII</td>
<td>3 Violen, Bc.</td>
<td>2 Vln., Organ</td>
<td>2 Vln., Vla., 2 Trmb.,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Closing</td>
<td>As the beginning</td>
<td></td>
<td>Bsns., Vc., Bass, Organ</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Given the fact that subsequent editions have failed to solve some of the problems created by the different versions of this work, as well as the confusion that has resulted from the contradictory solutions of the various editors, we can only hope with Arthur Mendel that »the last chapter in the history of this work has not been written.«\(^{36}\)

Developing quite independently from the movement in Germany in the late-nineteenth century to make the works of early composers accessible for the

---

Lutheran worship service, a similar *Bewegung* in France at this time was to lead to a revival of interest in the music of Schütz in that country. Under the leadership of Charles Bordes (1863-1909), a man who was the equal of the legendary Karl Vötterle (1902-1975) as a business mind and entrepreneur, some quite significant things were accomplished near the turn of the twentieth century in the field of Catholic church music. With the assistance of Alexandre Guilmant (1837-1911), Vincent d’Indy (1851-1931) and Louis Bourgault-Ducoudray (1840-1910), professor of music history at the Paris Conservatory, Bordes founded in 1894 the Society for sacred music known as the *Schola Cantorum*\(^{37}\), which in 1896 was transformed into a school for the revival of early church music. As one of its professors, as well as its director, he promoted performances of Gregorian Chant and the polyphonic music of Victoria, Josquin, Palestrina, and worked to create a modern repertory of vocal and instrumental music for the church. He also encouraged the leading French musical scholars to write for his *Tribune de Saint-Gervais*, the official publication of the Schola.\(^{38}\)

Among the many projects that grew out of the activities of the *Schola Cantorum* was a series of publications entitled *Concerts Spirituels*\(^{39}\), editions of the works of early composers that had a broader purpose than simply meeting the needs of the Catholic liturgy in France. Through this vehicle Bordes published excerpts from Bach cantatas and in 1902 the first French edition of one of the Passions of Schütz, the closing chorus of the St. Matthew Passion. These publications were edited by Bordes (at least in name) with the assistance of Guilmant, who realized the figured bass parts, and André Pirro (1869-1943), who provided the musicological expertise. The result was a series of practical editions distributed, not only in France and throughout the European continent but, in Mexico as well. Of special interest in the St. Matthew Passion edition was a twelve page critical notes section written by Pirro which discussed the composer’s importance in the history of music and the source used for the edition [the Spitta *Gesamtausgabe*]. Bordes’s publication contained the following editorial characteristics:

1. It included only the final movement of the Passion.
2. It was published with both German and French texts, the first work in this genre to appear with a French text.
3. It included an optional [ad libitum] organ accompaniment.
4. The bass line of the organ part was written in large notes as if it were a figured bass part, with the other three notes in smaller notes. The bass line was also designated for the pedal of the organ.
5. Dynamics and expression marks were added throughout.
6. A tempo change was inserted at measure 15 from *Maestoso* at the beginning to *Plus vite* following the fermata.

---

38 Michel Brenet (Marie Bobillier), »Bordes — In Memoriam,« La Tribune, numéro spécial (1910), pp. 13-16.
From the perspective of the late-20th century, this edition is not in itself significant; however, in 1902 it served a particular need for the French church musician. Writing in *A Tribune* at the time of Bordes’s death, Michel Brenet (18581-918), one of his collaborators at the Schola, placed the work of Bordes in its proper perspective:

There was needed [at the time] a truly practical edition, and hence a popular one, where the pieces were set down in a familiar notation in familiar clefs, and in a suitable register for the voices, with notation as to dynamics and similar directions for performance, necessary to guard against misinterpretation and whimsical interpretations.40

While Bordes’s competence as a musical scholar may have been questioned by his musicological peers, in light of the many practical editions which he published, the influence he exerted in the revival of early music in France is noteworthy.

One student who was attracted to the Schola as a result of the work of Bordes and his associates was Yvonne Rokseth (1890-1948).41 While not central to our study of early Schütz editions, she is a significant figure in the Schütz revival in the twentieth century and deserves special consideration because she is the first woman to prepare a complete edition of a Schütz Passion, the »Passion selon s. Jean« (SWV 481).42 Better known to this generation for her work in the music of the thirteenth century, she also had a life-long interest in Protestant church music. When she was called to the University of Strasbourg in 1937, she served as member of both the Faculté de Théologie Protestantte and the Faculté des Lettres where she offered lectures in hymnology and liturgy as well as musicology. In her own research she pursued studies in the History of Protestant Church Music. Her unpublished editions of the St. John and the St. Matthew Passions (incomplete) are one tangible result of this interest in seventeenth century music.

As an editor she followed in the tradition of Arnold Mendelssohn. Her French version of the »Passion selon s. Jean« is similar in style to the former’s *Historia nach dem Evangelisten St. Lucas*: The choruses are unaccompanied and the recitative sections are supported by the organ. In contrast to Mendelssohn’s recitative passages, with their high Baroque characteristics, Rokseth’s are less dramatic, more sostenuto (*stile accompagnato*), and absent of bar lines and metric markings. The alla breve indications in the Spitta edition are followed in the choral sections. Slurs are inserted to indicate the French syllables in the text, but there are no added expression markings other than textual emphases in the recitative sections.

*Die sieben Worte am Kreuz* (SWV 478), which has probably been published in its complete version more times than any of the composer’s other works in this genre, appears in two more German editions near the turn of the century. Neither establishes new directions, but should be noted in this survey. Interestingly, both are published by Breitkopf & Härtel. Salomon Jadassohn (1831-1902), a teacher at both the Leipzig Conservatory and University of Leipzig, made many editions of

40 Dowd.
41 Leo Schrade, »Yvonne Rokseth: In Memoriam,« *JAMS* 2:3 (Fall 1949), pp. 171-172.
early music, including all of Bach's large-scale vocal works. His version of *Die sieben Worte* is unique in that it calls for the accompaniment of the piano rather than the organ and/or instruments that are identified in the Kassel copy of the score. In other respects the edition is similar to the Spitta *Gesamtausgabe*: It is without dynamic, tempo or other expression marks. It is somewhat unusual for its time in that it leaves these decisions to the performer. With the accompaniment of the piano, Jadassohn makes it clear that this version is not designed primarily for the worship service, but for the concert hall. The edition of Albrecht Hänlein, on the other hand, fills the need for a performing edition that can be utilized either in a concert or liturgical setting. It is clearly based on the Spitta Complete Works edition.

III. New directions

It is interesting that Schütz' first composition in this genre, the *Historia der Auferstehung Jesu Christi* (1623) (SWV 50), is the last to find its way into print in a published edition. This version by Walter Simon Huber is also the earliest of these works to appear in a series of practical editions under the guidance of the Schütz-Gesellschaft and Bärenreiter Verlag. In addition to the music, there is a twelve page section at the back of the edition devoted to critical notes and performance instructions. As such it is the earliest performing edition of any of the Passions or Historiae to deal seriously with performance matters; also the first to discuss the text in more than a superficial manner.

Huber's source is the Berlin copy of the composer's own published version of 1623, the only complete copy of the original print work that survives in all seven parts (Evangelist, Choir and Soloists, Bassus generalis, and the 4 Viola parts). Like Spitta, the editor includes the instructions of the composer in the front of the publication in a facsimile version. It is clear from the beginning that this publication is influenced greatly by both the Spitta and Mendelssohn editions.

The editor follows the lead of Mendelssohn by fixing the rhythm of the recitative passages. (It should be noted that Huber's NSA edition [1956] leaves the neumatic notation in the score but inserts a rhythmic realization directly above the staff.) He also incorporates four Psalm settings from the Becker Psalter within the overall structure of the work (Chart IV, p. 128). Huber justifies this arrangement with the following statement:

46 Huber, Historia, p. 2.
### Chart IV: Historia der Auferstehung Jesus Christi – Macro Form (Huber, 1927)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Opening Chorus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Scene I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>Psalm 90 (From the Becker Psalter)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C2</td>
<td>Intermezzo I (The High Priest)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>Psalm 68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Scene II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>Psalm 117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E2</td>
<td>Intermezzo II (The Disciples)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E3</td>
<td>Psalm 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Scene III</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G</td>
<td>Closing Chorus</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The clear three parts of the plot of the Resurrection History reinforces the arrangement of incorporating choral pieces throughout the work. Schütz himself has written four exceptional choral pieces that are suitable for this purpose: they are the «Psalms of David» (after Cornelius Becker’s poems).47

He then goes on to relate this tripartite structure to the broader symbolism of the work.

In the performing edition, Huber includes dynamic, tempo and expression markings that are not found in the NSA version, but their presence here is significant in that they provide evidence of the editorial practices of the Schütz Gesellschaft in the late-1920s. The recommendations regarding the use of instruments in the performance of this work provide another clue to the prevailing editorial policies. In contrast to the Spitta SGA (Vol. I), where the intentions of the composer are followed explicitly in the use of four Viole da Gamba to accompany the Evangelist in the first Recitative, Huber’s performing edition includes a mixture of instruments both in this Recitative and in the final chorus. What is apparent in this edition is the recognition of the importance of scholarship and performance practice that is just beginning to emerge in the publications of early music in the twentieth century.

### IV. Summary

This survey of the earliest published editions of the Passions and Historiae has covered a span of eighty-five years (1842-1927), yet in this relatively short period we have observed significant changes in the reception to the work of Schütz. During this time the Dresden Master ceases to be viewed primarily as an austere figure from the past whose works are to be admired and studied as models of seventeenth

---

47 Huber, Historia, p. 75. »Die deutliche Dreiteilung der eigentlichen Handlung der Auferstehungshistorie legt den Gedanken nahe, diese Gliederung durch eingefügte Choralsätze noch zu verstärken. Nun hat Schütz selbst kurze vierstimmige Chorsätze geschrieben, die sich zu diesem Zweck außerordentlich gut eignen: das sind die 'Psalmen Davids' (nach Cornelius Beckers Um-dichtungen).«
century compositional technique. Rather he emerges as a nineteenth century personality of intense spiritual and emotional character, whose religious life and work stand at the center of his creativity. In the early period of his reception, his compositions are approached with great respect by editors like Becker and Riedel and very little is added to the original work of the Master. Near the end of the nineteenth century this great admiration is transformed into a desire on the part of the editors of the time to make this music more accessible to a wider musical public in church and concert hall; the published editions of Mendelssohn and Bordes thus contain those editorial practices and accretions (accompanied recitatives, original movements, chorale insertions, liturgical formulas, modern instruments, etc.) that will help in accomplishing this purpose. Finally, what begins to emerge in the early twentieth century is a point of view which recognizes that Schütz is actually better understood when his music is presented in its original setting; that he, in fact, speaks more clearly in the integrity of his own musical language. While there is only a hint of this new attitude in the work of Schering and Huber, its mere presence is significant in that it paves the way for the completely new view of the composer that is to develop later in the century.

We are thus left with an image of the composer in the early years of the twentieth century that is not unlike the reception which Johann Sebastian Bach received in a similar period of his revival: a picture that comes into clearer focus with each succeeding generation.

* 

APPENDIX: EARLY EDITIONS OF THE HISTORIAE AND PASSIONS OF HEINRICH SCHÜTZ

THE COLLECTED WORKS EDITION


SWV 50: THE RESURRECTION HISTORY


SWV 435: THE CHRISTMAS HISTORY


SWV 478: THE SEVEN WORDS OF CHRIST ON THE CROSS


SWV 479: THE ST. MATTHEW PASSION


SWV 480: THE ST. LUKE PASSION


SWV 481: THE ST. JOHN PASSION


EXCERPTS FROM THE PASSIONS

(11) »Drei Charfreitagsgesänge.«* Edited by Carl F. Becker. Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung 44:52 (December 28, 1842), Beilage No. 9, pp. 1-4.

